DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 422 592 CS 509 886

AUTHOR Knafle, June D.; Wescott, Alice Legenza
TITLE Public, Private, and Home School Children's Views of Forgiveness and Retribution in "Cinderella."
PUB DATE 1998-00-00
NOTE 31p.
PUB TYPE Reports - Research (143)
EDRS PRICE MF01/PC02 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS *Fairy Tales; *Grade 5; Home Schooling; Intermediate Grades; Interviews; Private Schools; Public Schools; *Reading Aloud to Others; *Sex Differences; Sex Role; Story Reading; *Student Reaction; Values
IDENTIFIERS *Cinderella; *Story Completion

ABSTRACT

Fifth Graders (N=626) from public, Catholic, Christian, and home schools reacted to values of forgiveness versus retribution in the two main versions of "Cinderella" by choosing which ending they preferred for themselves, for a 4-year old sister, and for a 4-year old brother. Girls preferred the forgiveness ending for themselves ($p<.001$) and for a sister ($p<.01$) more than boys did. Variations according to school and region (city, suburbs, rural) were slight, except for home school girls who preferred the forgiveness ending in all choices. Unexpectedly, both boys and girls would read the forgiveness ending to a sister, but tended to read the retribution ending to a brother. Reasons for choices are given as well as comparative data from older participants. For future research, it would be informative to conduct in-depth interviews with children of different ages and genders about values in children's stories. (Contains 4 tables of data and 28 references.) (CR)

****
* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made *
* from the original document. *
****

CS

ED 422 592

Running head:CHILDREN'S VIEWS OF FORGIVENESS AND RETRIBUTION

Public, Private, and Home School Children's Views of Forgiveness and Retribution in Cinderella

June D. Knafle
University of Illinois
at Chicago

Alice Legenza Wescott
Edmonds, Washington

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
Office of Educational Research and Improvement
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)
☑ This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it.
☐ Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality.
• Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official OERI position or policy.

J. Knafle

CS 509556

Abstract

Fifth graders (N = 626) from public, Catholic, Christian, and home schools reacted to values of forgiveness vs. retribution in the two main versions of Cinderella by choosing which ending they preferred for themselves, for a four year old sister, and for a four year old brother. Girls preferred the forgiveness ending for themselves ($p < .001$) and for a sister ($p < .01$) more than boys did. Variations according to school and region (city, suburbs, rural) were slight, except for home school girls who preferred the forgiveness ending in all choices. Unexpectedly, both boys and girls would read the forgiveness ending to a sister but tended to read the retribution ending to a brother. Reasons for choices are given as well as comparative data from older participants.

Public, Private, and Home School Children's Views of Forgiveness and Retribution in Cinderella

An examination of specific values contained in children's literature and children's reactions to those values is important and timely given the current emphasis on literature based reading instruction. This study investigated the reactions of children to the values of forgiveness versus retribution in the two main versions of Cinderella, Perrault's and Grimm's. In Perrault's version, Cinderella, who was "as good as she was beautiful," forgave her stepsisters and found lords of the court for them to marry on the same day as her wedding. In Grimm's version, the stepsisters had their eyes pecked out by birds on Cinderella's wedding day, so they were punished by blindness for their wickedness.

Much has been written about children's literature, including Cinderella, from all sorts of perspectives, but relatively little data based research has been done. Besides case studies, the children's literature research that exists tends to be scattered throughout a variety of disciplines (Short, 1995).

There are some relevant studies of forgiveness and retribution in the psychological, sociological, and theological literature. Children's reactions to dilemmas involving retribution have been looked at in terms of Kohlberg's levels of moral development (Cortese, 1982), and Percival and Haviland (1978), using Piagetian stories, found that when stories contained bad behavior, children tended to view subsequent negative happenings as being cause/effect

retribution. Darby and Schlenker (1982) found that children were more forgiving when apologies were more elaborate, and Grueneich and Trabasso (1981) discussed children's comprehension of motives and consequences in stories. Schwartz (1978) wrote about retribution and forgiveness in terms of sociological implications, and Johnson (1986) formulated a model of forgiveness. Enright and his colleagues described forgiveness according to developmental stages, provided a thorough summary and analysis of the literature, and described forgiveness education (Al-Mabuk, Enright, & Cardis, 1995; Enright, Gassin, & Wu, 1992; Enright and the Human Development Study Group, 1991). Some age differences have been found: four year olds enjoyed hearing cruel retaliatory acts in a fairy tale, while seven and eight year olds enjoyed equitable retaliation the most (Zillmann & Bryant, 1975). Additionally, the range of interpretations of Cinderella is wide, from Bettelheim's (1976) Freudian interpretations, to the Ulanovs' (1983) view of Cinderella as the suffering servant, or female Christ figure.

An examination of the reactions of children in different kinds of school settings (public, Catholic, Christian, and home schools) to the values of forgiveness versus retribution in the popular fairy tale seemed promising because Christian and Catholic schools place an emphasis on teaching forgiveness to their pupils. Since many home school parents teach their children at home because of the issue of values in the schools (Mayberry, 1988; Van

Galen, 1988), the inclusion of home school children in this study seemed pertinent. The overwhelming majority of home school parents identify themselves as observant Christians, and curriculum guides used by many home schoolers make a point of teaching forgiveness.

The expectation was that children from Christian, Catholic, and home schools would prefer Perrault's forgiveness ending more than public school children. We also expected that the reasons given for preferring the forgiveness ending would vary according to school type, with Christian, Catholic, and home school children giving more altruistic or religiously based reasons than public school children. We suspected that suburban and rural children would prefer the forgiveness ending more than city children, and that females would prefer the forgiveness ending more than males. We were curious whether children would choose to read the forgiveness or retribution ending to young sisters or brothers and whether their choices would correspond to their own preferences for the forgiveness or retribution ending for themselves. We were also curious whether children's previous knowledge of the endings would influence their choices.

Method

Participants

Of the 626 fifth graders who served as participants, there were 576 from city, suburban, and rural areas in public, Catholic, and Christian schools (M = 285, F = 291) and 50 home school fifth graders (M = 25, F = 25). The

children were from the midwest (primarily the Chicago area) and the state of Washington. Additionally, for comparison purposes, there were 80 tenth and twelfth graders (M = 33, F = 47) from a city public school and 197 adults (33 males and 164 females who were graduate and undergraduate students in a city public university).

Procedure

The children read a summary of the story of Cinderella up to the point where no one else's foot fits into the glass slipper, but Cinderella's foot does. They then read both of two very different endings for the story, Perrault's forgiveness ending and Grimm's retribution ending.

The children were asked whether they had heard or read each version before, which ending they preferred and why they preferred that ending, which ending they would read to a four year old sister (and why), and which ending they would read to a four year old brother (and why). They were also asked to write down any other known ending to the story.

The entire task of reading and writing was given in the children's classrooms with their teachers present and took about 30 minutes. A few children needed and were given extra time to finish. The home school children worked individually in small groups.

Data were also collected from several other groups to compare differences in responses from the fifth graders, namely tenth and twelfth grade students and adults; all completed the task in their classrooms. The adults were

asked which ending they would read to a four year old daughter and son instead of sister and brother.

Materials

After reading a summary of Cinderella without an ending, the children read the following page.

Here are two different endings.

Ending A.

Now her stepsisters recognized her. Cinderella was the beautiful person they had seen at the ball! They threw themselves at her feet and begged forgiveness for all their bad treatment of her. Cinderella asked them to rise, embraced them and told them she forgave them with all her heart. She begged them to love her always. Cinderella was conducted to the young prince. He found her lovelier than ever, and a few days afterwards, married her. Cinderella, who was as good as she was beautiful, gave her stepsisters a home at the palace and on the same day married them to two great lords of the court.

Have you heard or read Ending A. before? (Check one)

Yes_____ No_____

Ending B.

Then the prince looked into her face and recognized the lovely maiden with whom he had danced. Startled and alarmed, the stepmother and stepsisters turned pale with anger. But the prince lifted Cinderella on to his horse and rode away with her. When they passed by a hazel tree, two white doves flew down and settled on Cinderella's shoulders, one on the left and one on the right, and there they stayed. When the

time came for the wedding, the two wicked stepsisters hoped to join in the merrymaking. In the procession to the church they walked on either side of the bride. But the dove on her right shoulder pecked out the left eye of the eldest, and the dove on her left shoulder pecked out the right eye of the youngest. And when the procession came out of the church, the stepsisters had changed places, and the dove on the bride's right shoulder pecked out the left eye of the youngest and the dove on her left shoulder pecked out the right eye of the eldest. So for all their days they were punished with blindness on account of their wickedness and falsehood.

Have you heard or read Ending B. before? (Check one)

Yes_____ No_____

The next page presented the following questions: "Which ending do you like better, A. or B.? (Check one) Why do you like that ending better?" "If you had a four year old sister and were going to read the story to her, which ending would you read? (Check one) Why?" "If you had a four year old brother and were going to read the story to him, which ending would you read? (Check one) Why?" "If you know some other ending for Cinderella, describe it."

Statistical Treatment

Three-way analyses of variance (gender x region x school type) were completed for each of the five variables (knowledge of each version of the story, child's own ending preference, child's ending preference for a four year old sister, and child's ending preference for a four year old

brother) for students within the three way design. Additional analyses of variance (2 way - gender x group) were completed to compare the home school children's responses to those of the other children. (The home school group did not fit into the three-way design because there were few city home schoolers, reflecting national trends.) Post-hoc tests were completed using the Tukey a method. Correlation coefficients for the five variables were also computed.

Detailed content analyses were made for the children's responses as to why they preferred either ending for themselves, for a four year old sister, and for a four year old brother.

Findings

Table 1 shows the fifth graders' knowledge (%) of the two endings, and Table 2 shows the fifth graders' preferences (%) for the two endings according to gender, region, and school type. Table 3 shows the preferences for Perrault's (forgiveness) ending for each group.

The three-way analyses of variance revealed significant differences for the following main effects: a) region for the variable of the knowledge of the retribution ending (F (2,558) = 7.16, $p < .001$), with the city students knowing the retribution ending more frequently than the suburban students (Tukey a: $p < .005$) or the rural students (Tukey a: $p < .05$), b) gender differences for the variable of the knowledge of the retribution ending (F (1,558) = 3.98, $p < .05$), with the males knowing the retribution ending more

frequently than the females, c) gender differences for the variable of the child's own ending preference ($F(1,558) = 15.82$, $p < .001$), with the females preferring the forgiveness ending more frequently than the males, and d) gender differences for the variable of which ending the child would read to a four year old sister ($F(1,558) = 7.73$, $p < .01$), with the females reading the forgiveness ending to a four year old sister more frequently than the males. There were no significant differences for the other main effects. For interaction effects, the following differences were significant: a) region x school type for the knowledge of the forgiveness ending ($F(4,558) = 3.41$, $p < .01$), b) gender x school type for the knowledge of the retribution ending ($F(2,558) = 3.62$, $p < .05$), and c) region x gender for the child's own ending preference ($F(2,558) = 3.11$, $p < .05$).

The two-way analyses of variance, in which the home school children were included, revealed significant differences for the following main effects: a) group type for the variable of the knowledge of the forgiveness ending ($F(9,606) = 1.96$, $p < .05$), b) group type for the variable of the knowledge of the retribution ending ($F(9,606) = 2.96$, $p < .005$), c) group type for the variable of which ending the child would read to a four year old sister ($F(9,606) = 1.90$, $p < .05$), d) gender differences for the variable of the knowledge of the retribution ending ($F(1,606) = 4.02$, $p < .05$), with the males knowing the retribution ending more frequently than the females (M mean = .25; F mean = .19), e) gender differences for the variable of the child's own

ending preference ($F(1,606) = 20.37$, $p < .001$), with the females preferring the forgiveness ending more frequently than the males (M mean = .51; F mean = .69), and f) gender differences for the variable of which ending the child would read to a four year old sister ($F(1,606) = 8.66$, $p < .005$), with the females reading the forgiveness ending more frequently than the males (M mean = .73; F mean = .83). There were no significant differences for the other main effects nor for any of the interactions.

Significant findings for post-hoc tests for all ten groups (Tukey *a*) at the .05 level were a) for knowledge of the forgiveness ending, the suburban public mean (.54) was higher than the rural public mean (.22), b) for knowledge of the retribution ending, the city public mean (.33), the city Catholic mean (.32), and the city Christian mean (.31) were all higher than the home school mean (.06), and c) for the child's choice of the forgiveness ending for a four year old sister, the home school mean (.94) was higher than the city public mean (.68).

The correlation coefficients revealed significant correlations ($p < .01$) between a) which ending the children knew and which ending they preferred for themselves, b) which ending the children knew and which ending they would read to a four year old sister, and c) which ending the children preferred for themselves and which ending they would read to a four year old sister. The other correlations were not significant.

The home school girls' responses were the most extreme, followed by the rural Christian girls and the suburban Christian girls; 88% of the home school girls, 79% of the rural Christian girls, and 76% of the suburban Christian girls preferred the forgiveness ending for themselves; 100% of the home school girls, 97% of the rural Christian girls, and 88% of the suburban Christian girls would read the forgiveness ending to a four year old sister; the only group that clearly preferred the forgiveness ending for a four year old brother was the home school girls (68%). Of the boys, the group that most preferred the forgiveness ending was the home school boys, but the differences from the other groups were small (see Table 3).

Unexpectedly, both boys and girls would read the forgiveness ending to a four year old sister, but they tended to read the retribution ending to a four year old brother; the differences were large and consistent (see Table 3). The exception was the home school girls, who clearly preferred the forgiveness ending in all choices. We included questions about brother and sister choices in the task because we wanted to see whether boys would read their preferences to brothers and girls to sisters. We were surprised at the children's differing choices for sisters and brothers.

Reasons for Preferences

Children's reasons for preferring the forgiveness ending for themselves or for a four year old sister or brother varied from a bland "it's nice" and "it sounds

better" to responses such as "stepsisters asked for forgiveness," "can be nice to people even if they aren't nice to you," and "it teaches about forgiveness." Children's reasons for preferring the retribution ending varied from "it sounds better," "he/she would like it," "more exciting," "it's more for boys," "boys like violence" to responses such as "they got punished for being selfish," and "stepsisters got what they deserved."

Table 4 shows the percentage of forgiveness related reasons the children gave for choosing Ending A (Perrault's) and the percentage of retribution related reasons for choosing Ending B (Grimm's) according to gender, region, and school type. The forgiveness related reasons contained specific mention of forgiveness, compassion, or apologizing. The retribution related reasons contained specific mention of punishment, the most common response being "stepsisters got what they deserved." The percentages are based upon the total number of children in each group. For example, 8% (24/285) of the total group of males and 16% (48/291) of the total group of females gave forgiveness related reasons for preferring Ending A for themselves. If, however, we look at the numbers in terms of how many children who preferred Ending A for themselves gave forgiveness related reasons, those percentages become 17% (24/145) for males and 25% (48/195) for females.

An examination of Table 4 reveals only minor variations in the percentages of forgiveness related and retribution related responses given by the different groups. When giving

reasons why they preferred a specific ending for themselves, the children gave forgiveness related reasons much more than they did when asked about a sister or brother; the sister and brother reasons were much more stereotypically gender related. For a four year old sister, children's reasons for choosing Ending A, other than the forgiveness related reasons and "she'd like it better," were most often that it was less violent, nicer, had a happy ending, and they wouldn't want to scare her with Ending B. For a four year old brother, children's reasons for choosing Ending B, other than the retribution related reasons and "it's more for boys," were most often that boys like violence, aggression, scary stories, weird stories, mean endings, and "gross" and "sick things."

Overall, the children's reasons varied very little whether they were in public, Catholic, Christian, or home schools and whether they were from city, suburban, or rural areas. A noteworthy finding was that for all the groups, for the children who preferred Ending B for themselves, almost half of the reasons given were retribution related (44% for public schools, 51% for Catholic schools, 44% for Christian schools, and 57% for home schools). The children who preferred Ending A for themselves gave a smaller number of forgiveness related reasons (16% for public schools, 20% for Catholic schools, 27% for Christian schools, and 22% for home schools).

Tenth and Twelfth Graders

Tenth and twelfth grade males preferred the retribution ending for themselves (73%) but would read the forgiveness ending to a four year old sister (77%); for a four year old brother, 56% of the males would read the retribution ending. The females were split on personal preference but would overwhelmingly read the forgiveness ending to a four year old sister (98%); for a four year old brother, 59% of the females would read the forgiveness ending. Only 11% of the students were familiar with the forgiveness ending, and only 16% were familiar with the retribution ending.

Reasons for preferring the forgiveness ending for themselves often specifically mentioned forgiveness; the other most common reasons given were that Ending A was a happy ending and that fairy tales should have happy endings. Reasons for choosing the forgiveness ending for a four year old sister were most often that it was happier, nicer, less violent, positive, kinder, and that Ending B would scare or upset her. Reasons for choosing the forgiveness ending for a four year old brother were the same as those given for a four year old sister.

Reasons for preferring the retribution ending for themselves were most often that the stepsisters got what they deserved, a response that was given by 60% of those who chose Ending B for themselves. There were few reasons given for choosing the retribution ending for a four year old sister; most often students said that it would teach her a lesson. Reasons for choosing the retribution ending for a four year old brother were most often that it was exciting,

interesting, that he'd like it because of the violence and grossness, and that he would think it was funny.

For the 80 students, the percentage of forgiveness related reasons for preferring Ending A (Perrault's) for themselves was 19%; for a four year old sister, 11%; and for a four year old brother, 5%. The percentage of retribution related reasons for preferring Ending B (Grimm's) for themselves was 43%; for a four year old sister, 2%; and for a four year old brother, 9%. Of the students who preferred Ending A for themselves, 47% gave forgiveness related reasons, and of the students who preferred Ending B for themselves, 71% gave retribution related reasons.

Adults

Interestingly, the adults were inclined to read the forgiveness ending to a four year old son (M = 73%, F = 85%) as well as to a four year old daughter (M = 85%, F = 92%). They preferred the forgiveness ending slightly less for themselves (M = 65%, F = 81%). Only 24% of the males and 35% of the females were familiar with the forgiveness ending, and only 3% of the males and 12% of the females were familiar with the retribution ending.

Reasons for preferring the forgiveness or retribution ending for themselves or for a four year old son or daughter were much more specifically forgiveness related or retribution related than any of the other groups.

For the 197 adults, the percentage of forgiveness related reasons for preferring Ending A (Perrault's) for themselves was 44%; for a four year old daughter, 50%; and

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

for a four year old son, 46%. The percentage of retribution related reasons for preferring Ending B (Grimm's) for themselves was 15%; for a four year old daughter, 6%; and for a four year old son, 8%. Of the adults who preferred Ending A for themselves, 56% gave forgiveness related reasons, and of the adults who preferred Ending B for themselves, 69% gave retribution related reasons. A number of adults (12%) specifically mentioned that they would make no distinction between which ending to read to a four year old son or daughter based on gender.

Discussion

It was surprising that although there were minor variations in the responses of fifth graders from the different types of schools and regions, the differences we expected did not occur. (Several studies, such as Garrod and Beal, 1993, found that those from less affluent communities were more likely to focus on issues of rights and justice versus concern for others than those from more affluent communities.) It was also surprising that a difference we did not expect, did occur. A main finding was that girls preferred the forgiveness ending for themselves more than boys did and for a four year old sister more than boys did. Perhaps girls are raised to be more forgiving than boys.

The fact that we did not find the differences we expected among the different kinds of schools may be looked at in several ways. For example, Christian and Catholic school personnel, who emphasize the inculcation of specific values, could view the findings as dismaying, and then

decide that they need to increase their efforts to move from the theoretical presentation of forgiveness versus retribution to more activities at the application level. Those opposed to separate religious schools, however, could take comfort from the lack of differences in the students' responses, regardless of the school program differences. Christian, Catholic, and home school students did, however, give more forgiveness related reasons for their choices than did public school students. (See Battistich, Watson, Solomon, Schaps, and Solomon, 1991, and Lickona, 1991, for public school efforts to facilitate character development.)

The unexpected and surprising difference that occurred was that overwhelmingly the children, boys and girls, would read the forgiveness ending to a four year old sister, but they tended to read the retribution ending to a four year old brother. The group with the most extreme responses in terms of preferring the forgiveness ending for themselves and for a four year old sister or brother was the home school girls. Perhaps home school girls are more sheltered than other children in terms of exposure to violent stories, as shown by the low percentage of home school girls who had heard the retribution ending (4%). (See Knafle and Wescott, 1994, 1996, for a discussion of home school reading practices.)

It seems that efforts within the last twenty-five years in the elementary grades to diminish stereotypical gender related stories and to encourage children to view characters' actions without regard to gender have not had

much effect on ten year olds' ideas of what is appropriate for young males versus young females. The children's responses were surprising in view of such efforts to eliminate gender bias in school texts. University students who read the fifth graders' reasons for their choices made such comments as "I can't believe they're saying these things," and "How can they be so sexist?" It is important for educators to be aware that children's attitudes and preferences may support traditional sex-role stereotypes. (See Beal, Garrod, Ruben, Stewart, and Dekle, 1997, for a summary of research findings concerning the lack of gender differences in moral orientation in children.) It is also possible that some children responded more to the violence than to the forgiveness and retribution in the endings.

While the adults specifically mentioned forgiveness and retribution most often of all the groups, followed by the tenth and twelfth graders, the children's percentages of forgiveness and retribution related reasons for their choices were lower. (After seeing the surprising responses of the fifth graders, we decided to give the task to adults, and after seeing that the responses of the adults were different from those of the fifth graders, we decided to see whether high school students' responses would fall between the two groups in terms of their choices and their reasons. The results did show such a progression among the groups.)

This study seemed to generate unusual interest among teachers and principals. We were originally concerned that we would have a difficult time finding schools, especially

private schools, that would agree to allow their students to participate. That was not the case. The fact that Cinderella is such a well known and popular fairy tale is probably responsible for the interest in participating in the study.

There are all sorts of interesting studies concerning Cinderella. For example, Bottingheimer (1987) looked at the direct and indirect speech in succeeding publications of the tale and concluded that Wilhelm Grimm "removed direct speech from women and gave it to men." (p. 59) and also used direct speech to define character. Worthy and Bloodgood (1992/1993) presented ways to teach different versions of Cinderella in the classroom, and the enduring interest in Cinderella has even generated a popular book, The Cinderella Complex, Women's Hidden Fear of Independence (Dowling, 1981).

The specific concerns of this study, forgiveness and retribution, have also been looked at in different ways. Some researchers (Hunter, 1978; Pattison, 1965) have equated success in the ability to forgive with emotional maturity. Bettelheim (1976), however, clearly preferred Grimm's retribution ending to Perrault's forgiveness ending; he felt that retribution reassures the child and makes him feel secure and that the happy ending is deficient and "incomplete without the punishment of the antagonists" (p. 273). In his detailed discussion of Cinderella, Bettelheim omitted any mention of forgiveness, stating that it was incomprehensible why Cinderella would care for her stepsisters' love, or they hers.

The issues of what kinds of values are presented in stories for children and how to explore children's responses to those stories are important and deserve increased scrutiny. (See Clare, Gallimore, and Patthey-Chavez, 1996, for a discussion of using moral dilemmas from children's literature to teach moral education as well as reading comprehension.) Knafle (1994) found pronounced differences between the values found in earlier children's literature versus more contemporary stories, with contemporary stories having main characters that are more self absorbed and alienated from adults. This study provides information about children's reactions to, and preferences for, forgiveness and retribution in a popular fairy tale. For future research, it would be interesting and informative to conduct in depth interviews with children of different ages and genders about those values and other values in children's stories.

References

Al-Mabuk, Radhi H., Enright, Robert D., & Cardis, Paul A. (1995). Forgiveness education with parentally love-deprived late adolescents. Journal of Moral Education, 24, 427-444.

Battistich, Victor, Watson, Marilyn, Soloman, Daniel, Schaps, Eric, & Solomon, Judith. (1991). The child development project: A comprehensive program for the development of prosocial character. In W. Kurtines & J. Gewirtz (Eds.) Handbook of moral behavior and development, (Vol. 3, pp. 1-34). Hillsdale, NJ: Erlbaum.

Beal, Carole R., Garrod, Andrew, Ruben, Kate, Stewart, Terri L., & Dekle, Dawn J. (1997). Children's moral orientation: does the gender of dilemma character make a difference? Journal of Moral Education, 26, 45-58.

Bettelheim, Bruno. (1976). The uses of enchantment, The meaning and importance of fairy tales. New York: Random House, Inc.

Bottigheimer, Ruth B. (1987). Grimm's bad girls and bold boys, The moral and social vision of the tales. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press.

Clare, Lindsay, Gallimore, Ronald, & Patthey-Chavez, G. Genevieve. (1996). Using moral dilemmas in children's literature as a vehicle for moral educatiion and teaching reading comprehension. Journal of Moral Education, 25, 325-341.

Cortese, Anthony. (1982, September). A comparative analysis of cognition and moral judgment in Chicano, Black

ST COPY AVAILABLE

and Anglo children. Paper presented at the annual meeting of the American Sociological Association, San Francisco.

Darby, Bruce W., & Schlenker, Barry R. (1982). Children's reactions to apologies. Journal of Personality and Social Psychology, 43, 742-753.

Dowling, Colette. (1981). The Cinderella complex, Women's hidden fear of independence. New York: Pocket Books, Simon & Schuster, Inc.

Enright, Robert D., Gassin, Elizabeth A., & Wu, Ching-Ru. (1992). Forgiveness: A developmental view, Journal of Moral Education, 21, 99-114.

Enright, Robert D., & the Human Development Study Group. (1991). The moral development of forgiveness. In W. Kurtines & J. Gewirtz (Eds.), Handbook of moral behavior and development, (Vol. 1, pp.123-152). Hillsdale, NJ: Erlbaum.

Garrod, Andrew, & Beal, Carole R. (1993). Voices of care and justice in children's responses to fable dilemmas. In A. Garrod (Ed.), Approaches to moral development; new research and emerging themes (pp. 59-71). New York: Teachers College Press.

Grueneich, Royal, & Trabasso, Tom. (1981). The story as a social environment: Children's comprehension and evaluation of intentions and consequences. In J. H. Harvey (Ed.), Cognition, social behavior, and the environment (pp. 265-287). Hillsdale, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.

Hunter, R. C. A. (1978). Forgiveness, retaliation and paranoid reactions. Canadian Psychiatric Association Journal, 23(3), 167-173.

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

Johnson, Karen A. (1986). A model of forgiveness: Theory formulations and research implications. Doctor of Psychology Research Paper, Biola University, CA (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No: ED 273 893)

Knafle, June D. (1994). Values, agendas, and preferences in children's and young adult literature. In E. H. Cramer & M. Castle (Eds.), Fostering the love of reading: The affective domain in reading education (pp. 169-182). Newark, DE: International Reading Association.

Knafle, June D., & Wescott, Alice L. (1994). Home schoolers learn to read. The Reading Professor, 16(2), 12-25.

Knafle, June D., & Wescott, Alice L. (1996). Home schoolers talk about reading instruction. The Reading Professor, 19(1), 4-16.

Lickona, Thomas. (1991). Educating for character: How our schools can teach respect and responsibility. New York: Bantam Books.

Mayberry, Maralee. (1988). Characteristics and attitudes of families who home school. Education and Urban Society, 21, 32-41.

Pattison, E. Mansell. (1965). On the failure to forgive or to be forgiven. American Journal of Psychotherapy, 19, 106-115.

Percival, Pamela, & Haviland, Jeanette M. (1978). Consistency and retribution in children's immanent justice decisions. Developmental Psychology, 14, 132-136.

Schwartz, Barry. (1978). Vengeance and forgiveness: The uses of beneficence in social control, School Review, 86, 655-668.

Short, Kathy G. (Ed.). (1995). Research and professional resources in children's literature: Piecing a patchwork quilt. Newark, DE: International Reading Association.

Ulanov, Ann B., & Ulanov, Barry. (1983). Cinderella and her sisters, The envied and the envying. Philadelphia: Westminster Press.

Van Galen, Jane A. (1988). Ideology, curriculum, and pedagogy in home education. Education and Urban Society, 21, 52-68.

Worthy, M. Jo., & Bloodgood, Janet. W. (1992/1993). Enhancing reading instruction through Cinderella tales. The Reading Teacher, 46, 290-301.

Zillman, Dolf, & Bryant, Jennings. (1975). Viewer's moral sanction of retribution in the appreciation of dramatic presentations. Journal of Experimental Social Psychology, 11, 572-582.

Author Note

Lawrence M. Kenney, Linda Jani, and Irene Reiter assisted with the data collection, and Ranfen Li, Joanne Donohue, Amanda Bial, Kathleen Doran, and Gerald Nihill assisted with the data analysis.

Correspondence concerning this article should be addressed to June D, Knafle, College of Education, M/C 147, University of Illinois at Chicago, 1040 W. Harrison Street, Chicago, Illinois 60607-7133. Electronic mail may be sent via Internet to JKnafle@uic.edu. FAX:(312) 996 6400.

Table 1

Knowledge of Perrault's (Forgiveness) Ending and Grimm's (Retribution) Ending (%) of Cinderella According to Gender, Region, and School Type, and Home School

	n	Knew A[a]	Knew B[b]
Gender			
Male	285	39	27
Female	291	40	20
Region			
City	216	39	32
Suburbs	196	43	17
Rural	164	35	20
School Type			
Public	187	40	25
Catholic	202	42	22
Christian	187	36	24
Home School	50	36	6

Note. Students who had not heard or read Ending A or Ending B most often recalled a "they lived happily ever after" type ending.

[a]Perrault's forgiveness ending. [b]Grimm's retribution ending.

Table 2

Preferences (%) for Perrault's (Forgiveness) Ending and Grimm's (Retribution) Ending of Cinderella According to Gender, Region, and School Type, and Home School

		You[a]		Sister[b]		Brother[c]	
	n	Perr.	Grm.	Perr.	Grm.	Perr.	Grm.
Gender							
Male	285	51	49	72	28	43	57
Female	291	67	33	81	19	42	58
M & F	576	59	41	77	23	42	58
Region							
City	216	59	41	72	28	38	62
Suburbs	196	62	38	79	21	46	54
Rural	164	55	45	79	21	43	57
School Type							
Public	187	55	45	75	25	40	60
Catholic	202	63	37	76	24	45	55
Christian	187	59	41	79	21	42	58
Home School	50	72	28	94	6	62	38

[a]Prefer for themselves. [b]Would read to sister. [c]Would read to brother.

Table 3

Preferences (%) for Perrault's (Forgiveness) Ending of Cinderella for Each Group

	n	You[a]	Sister[b]	Brother[c]
City Public				
Male	41	54	63	29
Female	34	50	73	35
City Catholic				
Male	36	61	72	47
Female	37	73	78	40
City Christian				
Male	31	52	71	35
Female	37	65	76	40
Suburban Public				
Male	31	61	87	45
Female	36	61	81	47
Suburban Catholic				
Male	31	55	71	55
Female	37	70	78	43
Suburban Christian				
Male	36	53	72	50
Female	25	76	88	36
Rural Public				
Male	24	37	67	46
Female	21	62	81	43
Rural Catholic				
Male	30	50	70	37
Female	31	68	84	45
Rural Christian				
Male	25	24	72	44
Female	33	79	97	45
Home School				
Male	25	56	88	56
Female	25	88	100	68

Note. Preferences for Grimm's (retribution) ending comprised the remaining percentage; for example, since 54% of the city public males preferred Perrault's ending for themselves, 46% of those same males preferred Grimm's ending for themselves.

[a]Prefer for themselves. [b]Would read to sister. [c]Would read to brother.

Table 4

Specific Forgiveness Reasons (%) for Ending A Preferences and Specific Retribution Reasons (%) for Ending B Preferences According to Gender, Region, and School Type, and Home School

		You[a]		Sister[b]		Brother[c]	
		Ending		Ending		Ending	
	n	A	B	A	B	A	B
Gender							
Male	285	8	21	5	5	3	5
Female	291	16	16	8	2	5	5
Region							
City	216	13	18	6	4	4	4
Suburbs	196	15	16	6	2	4	4
Rural	164	9	23	7	4	4	8
School Type							
Public	187	9	20	2	3	2	4
Catholic	202	12	19	10	4	4	6
Christian	187	16	18	6	2	6	5
Home School	50	16	16	8	0	6	2

[a]Prefer for themselves. [b]Would read to sister. [c]Would read to brother.